

PHYSIOLOGICAL RESPONSES OF WOMEN AND MEN TO EXERCISE-INDUCED HEAT STRESS IN FIREFIGHTING GEAR

Denise L. Smith and Timothy S. Manning

Department of Physical Education
Skidmore College, Saratoga Springs, N.Y., USA

INTRODUCTION

Firefighting involves performing strenuous physical work in heavy (approx. 20 kg), protective clothing. The combination of exercise, the weight, insulative properties, and low moisture vapor permeability of the gear, and the external heat load places a considerable physiological stress on the body. Because of its central role in metabolism and thermoregulation, the cardiovascular system is largely responsible for meeting the demands of the physical activity and the thermal stress. During firefighting, a competition for blood flow ensues between the metabolically active muscles and the body's heat dissipating mechanisms. If the cardiovascular system fails to meet these competing demands, heat stress injuries may occur.

Although it is well recognized that heat stress places a considerable load on the body, there are relatively few studies that have documented the magnitude of the physiological stress of performing work in firefighting gear. Fewer studies have investigated the differences between the physiological responses of men and women while performing work in firefighting gear, despite the dramatic increase in the number of women in the fire service. Therefore, the purpose of this study was to describe the effects of exercise-induced heat stress in firefighting gear on selected physiological variables in healthy young women and men.

METHODS

Subjects were 15 healthy volunteers (N=7 men, N=8 women) between the ages of 17 and 37 years. All subjects provided written informed consent and completed a health history questionnaire prior to testing. The protocol was approved by the Human Subject's Review Board. All subjects were free of all known cardiovascular disease. The men were significantly heavier (75.9 ± 9.7 vs 61.8 ± 5.7 kg) and taller (178.9 ± 8.2 vs 168.3 ± 8.8 cm), and had a higher maximal oxygen consumption (56.7 ± 12.3 vs 44.9 ± 2.9 ml/kg/min) than the women who participated in this study.

A repeated measures within subject design was utilized. Subjects performed 20 minutes of stepping exercise on a Stairmaster (Model 4000) in two different clothing conditions; namely a control condition and a gear condition. On separate days subjects wore: (a) cotton shorts and T-shirt (control condition), and (b) firefighting turn-out gear

(bunker pants, coat, boots, helmet, hood and gloves). The order of testing was randomized. All testing was conducted in a thermoneutral laboratory.

Prior to the testing days, subjects performed a maximal, incremental work test on a motor driven treadmill until volitional fatigue. The maximal oxygen consumption (VO_2max) values obtained during the initial testing served as a descriptor of each subject's fitness level, and allowed the investigators to express each participant's submaximal workload on a relative basis. All subjects were familiarized with the stairstepping machine and the exercise protocol during the initial laboratory visit.

The testing protocol included a 4 minute pre-exercise period (resting), 20 minutes of submaximal stepping exercise and 10 minutes of recovery. Oxygen consumption was measured each minute via indirect spirometry. Heart rate was measured every minute using a 12 lead ECG (Quinton 750) which was interfaced with an automated blood pressure machine (Quinton 410) that recorded blood pressure every four minutes. Rectal temperature was recorded each minute throughout testing using a rectal thermistor (YSI, Model 511) inserted 10 cm beyond the external sphincter. The probe was connected to a YSI telethermometer (Model 4000) and displayed digitally. Peak acceleration, peak velocity and stroke distance of blood in the ascending aorta was measured using continuous wave ultrasound (Exerdop; Quinton Instruments). A transducer, placed in the suprasternal notch of the subject and pointed down towards the ascending aorta, measured the frequency shift of the continuous wave between the wand and the blood being ejected from the heart. Psychological measurements were obtained throughout the testing to assess thermal distress and rating of perceived exertion. Perceptions of thermal sensations were measured every four minutes using a scale developed by Young et al. (1987) with verbal anchors ranging from unbearably cold to unbearably hot. Ratings of perceived exertion (RPE) were measured every four minutes during the 20 minutes of exercise using the 6-20 Borg scale (Borg, 1985).

RESULTS

All subjects completed the 20 minutes of stepping exercise in both conditions. Table 1 presents the values obtained during the control trial and during the firefighting turnout gear trial. The oxygen consumption, expressed relative to body weight (ml/kg/min), did not vary significantly between the sexes for either the control or gear trial. However, because the women had a lower VO_2max , they were working at a significantly higher percentage of VO_2max than the men for both conditions.

Heart rate, oxygen consumption, thermal distress and ratings of perceived exertion were higher for both sexes when the exercise was performed in the turnout gear. Additionally, the women had a higher systolic blood pressure when the work was performed in the gear condition. Rectal temperature at the end of exercise was not significantly different between trials. None of the Doppler variables (peak acceleration,

Table 1 End-exercise values for both sexes under both conditions. (Mean \pm 1s.d.)

	MEN		WOMEN	
	Control	Gear	Control	Gear
HR (bpm)	133.7 (19.7)	168.4 (27.2) ^a	151.1 (11.5)	178.4 (9.9) ^a
VO ₂ (ml/kg/min)	24.2 (3.2)	29.1 (5.4) ^a	23 (1.5)	28 (1.9) ^a
VO ₂ (% of max)	43.6 (5.7)	52.5 (10.3) ^{a,b}	51.4 (4.3)	62.7 (5.8) ^{a,b}
SBP (mmHg)	171.5 (13.6)	178.5 (12.7)	153.8 (8.8) ^b	169.4 (9.6) ^a
DBP (mmHg)	69.6 (10.5)	70.3 (12)	78.1 (12.7)	79.9 (12.6)
T _c (C)	37.7 (0.5)	37.8 (0.5)	37.8 (0.3)	37.9 (0.3)
PkA (cm/s/s)	38.3 (8.4)	48.4 (16.4)	36.8 (17.6)	48 (14.5)
PkV (cm/s)	1.2 (2)	1.2 (0.1)	1.04 (3)	1.2 (0.3)
TVI (cm)	12.9 (2.5)	10.6 (2.4)	9.68 (3.2)	11.2 (1.9)
TD	5.25 (3)	6.8 (0.6) ^a	5.1(0.7)	6.7 (0.5) ^a
RPE	13 (1.4)	15 (1.3) ^a	12.3 (1.6)	14.8 (1.5) ^a

^a p < .05; Control vs. Gear

^b p < .05; Men vs. Women

peak velocity, time-velocity integrals) were significantly different at the end of the gear trial compared to the control trials. However, peak acceleration was approximately 25% higher following the gear trial for both men and women. The time-velocity integral, on the other hand, was approximately 18% lower at the end of exercise in the gear trial for the men and approximately 16% higher at the end of exercise in the gear trial for the women. The failure of rectal temperature to increase significantly is likely related to the relatively light workload and the short duration of the exercise task.

Despite the fact that women were working at a higher percentage of VO₂max, there were no significant differences between the sexes for heart rate, oxygen consumption (ml/kg/min), blood pressure, rectal temperature, Doppler variables or psychological variables at the end of exercise in the gear condition. Despite the lack of statistical significance, the heart rates at the end of exercise was 17 bpm higher for women than for men at the completion of the exercise in the control condition and 10 bpm higher than the men's at the end of the gear trial.

DISCUSSION

Heart rate and oxygen consumption are greater when exercise is performed in firefighting gear than when the same exercise is performed in shorts and a T-shirt. This is due to the weight, insulative properties and low moisture vapor permeability of the clothing. Furthermore, the ratings of thermal distress and ratings of perceived exertion mimic the physiological variables (Smith et al, 1995). The results of this study suggest that when men and women perform the same absolute submaximal workload for short periods in firefighting gear they respond in a similar manner. This is consistent with other data that suggests that men and women of similar fitness respond to exercise in

hot environments in the same way. In fact, the slightly higher heart rates seen in the female subjects in this study are most likely related to the fact that they had a lower VO_2max and were therefore working at a higher percentage of VO_2max . It should be noted that the exercise duration was short and that greater differences may be evident following prolonged exercise.

It is interesting to note the different trends in the male and female response for the time-velocity integral. Assuming that aortic diameter is unchanged throughout the testing protocol, changes in the time-velocity integral parallel changes in stroke volume ($\text{SV} = \text{cross-sectional area of aorta times TVI}$). The trend for stroke volume to be lower at the end of the gear trial in males is consistent with published data that suggests that stroke volume is lower when exercise is performed in a hot environment versus a themoneutral environment (Rowell, 1974). The trend for stroke volume to be higher at the completion of the gear trial in females is more difficult to explain. It is possible that this finding is related to an earlier and more profuse sweating in males (Avellini et al, 1980). A greater sweat loss could cause a reduction in left-ventricular end diastolic volume, thereby leading to a decrease in stroke volume (Coyle & Montain, 1993). This trend warrants further investigation.

REFERENCES

1. Borg, G. An Introduction to Borg's RPE-scale. Movement, Ithaca. (1985).
2. Cooling different body surfaces during upper and lower body exercise. Journal of Applied Physiology. 63:1218-1223 (1987).
3. Smith, D.L., S.J. Petruzzello, J.M. Kramer, S.E. Warner, B.G. Bone, & J.E. Misner: Selected physiological and psychobiological responses to physical activity in different configurations of firefighting gear. Ergonomics. 38(10):2065-2077 (1995).
4. Avellini, B.A., E. Kamon, & J.T. Krajewski: Physiological responses of physically fit men and women to acclimation to humid heat. Journal of Applied Physiology. 49:254-261 (1980).
5. Rowell, L.B.: Human cardiovascular adjustments to exercise and thermal stress. Physiological Reviews. 54:75-159 (1974).
6. Coyle, E. F. & S. J. Montain: Thermal and cardiovascular responses to fluid replacement during exercise. In: Gisolfi, C. V., D. R. Lamb, E. R. Nadel (Eds.) Perspectives in Exercise Science and Sports Medicine Vol. 6: Exercise, Heat, and Thermoregulation. Indianapolis: Benchmark Press, pp. 179-213 (1993).